HISTORICAL ANALYSIS - Comparison... The New Deal and the Great Society

From the 2015 Revised Framework:

COMPARE & CONTRAST...

- Compare diverse perspectives represented in primary and secondary sources in order to draw conclusions about one or more historical events.
- Compare different historical individuals, events, developments, and/ or processes, analyzing both similarities and differences in order to draw historically valid conclusions. Comparisons can be made across different time periods, across different geographical locations, and between different historical events or developments within the same time period and/ or geographical location.

How does the POV of the two cartoons at right summarize similarities and differences between the two programs?



From the Period 7 Content Outline:

Key Concept 7.1: Growth expanded opportunity, while economic instability led to new efforts to reform U.S. society and its economic system.

III. During the 1930s, policymakers responded to the mass unemployment and social upheavals of the Great Depression by transforming the U.S. into a limited welfare state, redefining the goals and ideas of modern American liberalism.

- A) Franklin Roosevelt's New Deal attempted to end the Great Depression by using government power to provide relief to the poor, stimulate recovery, and reform the American economy.
- B) Radical, union, and populist movements pushed Roosevelt toward more extensive efforts to change the American economic system, while conservatives in Congress and the Supreme Court sought to limit the New Deal's scope.
- C) Although the New Deal did not end the Depression, it left a legacy of reforms and regulatory agencies and fostered a long-term political realignment in which many ethnic groups, African Americans, and working- class communities identified with the Democratic Party.

From the Period 8 Content Outline:

Key Concept 8.2: New movements for civil rights and liberal efforts to expand the role of government generated a range of political and cultural responses.

- III. Liberalism influenced postwar politics and court decisions, but it came under increasing attack from the left as well as from a resurgent conservative movement.
 - A) Liberalism, based on anticommunism abroad and a firm belief in the efficacy of government power to achieve social goals at home, reached a high point of political influence by mid-1960s.
 - B) Liberal ideas found expression in Lyndon Johnson's Great Society, which attempted to use federal legislation and programs to end racial discrimination, eliminate poverty, and address other social issues. A series of Supreme Court decisions expanded civil rights and individual liberties.
 - C) In the 1960s, conservatives challenged liberal laws and court decisions and perceived moral and cultural decline, seeking to limit the role of the federal government and enact more assertive foreign policies.
 - D) Some groups on the left also rejected liberal policies, arguing that political leaders did too little to transform the racial and economic status quo at home and pursued immoral policies abroad.
 - E) Public confidence and trust in government's ability to solve social and economic problems declined in the 1970s in the wake of economic challenges, political scandals, and foreign policy crises.
 - F) The 1970s saw growing clashes between conservatives and liberals over social and cultural issues, the power of the federal government, race, and movements for greater individual rights.

Comparing and Contrasting The New Deal and the Great Society

Thematic Learning Objectives From the 2015 Revised Framework:

POL-1.0: Explain how and why political ideas, beliefs, institutions, party systems, and alignments have developed and changed.

POL-2.0: Explain how popular movements, reform efforts, and activist groups have sought to change American society and institutions.

POL-3.0: Explain how different beliefs about the federal government's role in U.S. social and economic life have affected political debates and policies.

<u>Directions/Prompt:</u> Compare and contrast Franklin Roosevelt's New Deal and Lyndon Johnson's Great Society by explaining how their beliefs and policies affected American society, the role of the federal government, and political alignments. Add your analysis/notes in the space provided. Highlight key terms and <u>underline each time you address the ABC</u> (three categories outlined in the prompt) and each time you <u>address the extent to which they were similar or different</u>. Some entries have been completed for you. Use these as models for what complete entries/analysis should look like.

Area of Reform	FDR's New Deal	LBJ's Great Society	For each reform, explain how FDR & LBJ's beliefs and policies affected American Society, the role of the federal government, or political alignments as well as noting the extent to which they were similar or different.
Social Welfare	Social Security Act, 1935 Aid to Dependent Children, 1939	Economic Opportunity Act, 1964 which created: Office of Economic Opportunity, Head Start, VISTA	FDR: LBJ:
		Medical Care Act, 1965 (Medicare and Medicaid)	Were they more similar or different?
Labor	Section 7 of NIRA, 1933	Minimum Wage Act, 1966	FDR:
	Wagner Act, 1935 National Labor Relations Board (set up by Wagner Act), 1935		LBJ:
	Fair Labor Standards Act, 1938		Were they more similar or different?

Historical Analysis Activity written by Rebecca Richardson, Allen High School

using the 2015 Revised College Board Advanced Placement United States history framework, public domain images, and thesis formula which was adapted from John P. Irish, Carroll High School

Area of Reform	FDR's New Deal	LBJ's Great Society	For each reform, explain how FDR & LBJ's beliefs and policies affected American Society, the role of the federal government, or political alignments as well as noting the extent to which they were similar or different.
Gender Equality	No direct acts (but he did nominate first woman to cabinet position, Francis Perkins and First Lady Eleanor fought for women's rights)	Civil Rights Act, 1964	 FDR: policies did increase opportunity for women but <u>did not significantly impact American society</u> because under NRA, there was a lower minimum wage for women, only 7% of CWA workers were female, and none in CCC. Majority of Americans (and the President) saw the Depression as crisis for bread winners (men). LBJ: policies increased opportunities for women as well as <u>changed the role of the federal</u> government because the Civil Rights Act of 1964 banned discrimination based on gender (as well as race) [FYI JFK also addressed this with the Equal Pay Act, 1963 which ended gender gap in wages under FDR's Fair Labor Standards Act] Were they more similar or different? Although both the New Deal and Great Society addressed gender discrimination by increasing opportunities for women, LBJ was more responsible for change than FDR. Therefore they were <u>similar to a small extent</u>. Although these presidents did support legislation that addressed gender, women like Eleanor Roosevelt, Alice Paul, and Betty Friedan did most of the work to push the issues to the forefront of government.
Immigration; Aliens; Citizens of Foreign Descent	Repatriation of Mexican citizens, 1929-1937 Tydings-McDuffie Act, 1934 Bracero Program, 1942	Civil Rights Act, 1964 Immigration Act, 1965	FOR: FDR's policies were in line with long held nativist beliefs and policies so <u>not a big impact on</u> <u>American society</u> because even though in some areas, Mexican-Americans got jobs through New Deal, 500,000 Mexicans deported/Mexican Repatriation (60% were American citizens). After WWII began, demand for labor led to Bracero Program and many of them returned. 20% of Asian immigrants went back to Asia. Japanese-American got around the law preventing them from owning land by putting land in the name of the American born children. West Coast racism cut Asian workers out of many employment opportunities. (Chinese-Americans worse off than the Japanese-Americans). Chinese immigrants were classified as "aliens ineligible for citizenship" so couldn't benefit from New Deal programs. Filipinos, were from an American territory so they were not impacted by immigration quotas from 1920s and found jobs but after Tydings-McDuffie Act of 1934 they were once again classified as "aliens" and were <mark>cut off from New Deal programs. LBJ:</mark> Were they more similar or different?

Unit 8, Period 8
For each reform, explain how FDR & LBJ's beliefs and policies affected American Society, the role of the federal government, or political alignments as well as noting the extent to which they were similar or different.
FDR: For Blacks - minimally successful in bettering American society because still facing largest
numbers of poverty and unemployment. Black jobs in <mark>CCC</mark> were <mark>segregated</mark> . <mark>Social Security Act and</mark>
Wagner Act excluded domestic and agricultural jobs held by most Blacks. FDR refused to sign
federal <mark>anti-lynching bill</mark> . The <mark>AAA</mark> helped White landowners and <mark>neglected the Black</mark>
sharecroppers. However under WPA 18% of jobs for Blacks (were only 10% of population) and the
Resettlement Administration protected the rights of Black farmers. Majority of Blacks voted for FDR
and remain loyal to the Democratic Party today; <u>affecting political alignment.</u> FDR's "Black
Cabinet" employed people like Mary McLeod Bethune who advised the President but he never took
bold action for fear of losing Southern votes and support for other New Deal programs. For
American Indians - the IRA ended forced assimilation and helped restore tribal ownership,

<mark>Amerícan Indíans</mark> -the IRA end although American Indians were still pretty much controlled by government; the <u>role of the federal</u> government remained constant - controlling Indian Reservations and maintaining their dependence on the government. Most Indíans líved on Reservations.

LBJ:

FDR's New Deal

Indian

Act. 1934

Reorganization

"Black Cabinet"

Area

of Reform

Civil Rights

for African

Americans

American

Indians

and

LBJ's

1964

1964

1965

Society

Civil Rights Act,

24th Amendment,

Voting Rights Act,

Great

Were they more similar or different?

Unit 8	3, Pe	riod 8
--------	-------	--------

Banking Act, 1933 Not a priority FDR: Banking Act, 1933 Glass-Steagal Act, 1933 Not a priority FDR: Banking Act, 1933 Securities and Exchange Commission Full Commission Full Commission Banking Act, 1933 Securities and Exchange Commission Full Commission Full Commission Banking Act, 1935 Full Commission Full Commission Full Commission Banking Act, 1935 Full Commission Full Commission Full Commission Banking Act, 1935 Full Commission Full Commission Full Commission Banking Act, 1935 Full Commission Full Commission Full Commission Banking Act, 1935 Full Commission Full Commission Full Commission Banking Act, 1935 Full Commission Full Commission Full Commission Banking Act, 1935 Full Commission Full Commission Full Commission Banking Act, 1935 Full Commission Full Commission Full Commission Banking Act, 1935 Full Commission Full Commission Full Commission Federal Music Project, Fulpher Education	Area of Reform	FDR's New Deal	LBJ's Great Society	For each reform, explain how FDR & LBJ's beliefs and policies affected American Society, the role of the federal government, or political alignments as well as noting the extent to which they were similar or different.
Education & the ArtsFederal Writers Project, Federal Art Project, Federal Music (all parts of the WPA), 1935Elementary and Secondary 1965Higher Education Act, 1965National Endowment for the Arts and Humanities, 1965National Endowment for the Arts and Humanities, 1965	Money;	Banking Act, 1933 Glass-Steagall Act, 1933 National Industrial Recovery Act, 1933 Securities and Exchange Commission Banking Act, 1935 Revenue Act	Not a priority	LBJ:
		Project, Federal Art Project, Federal Music Project (all parts of the	Secondary Education Act, 1965 National Endowment for the Arts and Humanities, 1965 Higher Education	LBJ:

Unit 8, Period 8

Area of Reform	FDR's New Deal	LBJ's Great Society	For each reform, explain how FDR & LBJ's beliefs and policies affected American Society, the role of the federal government, or political alignments as well as noting the extent to which they were similar or different.
Environment	Tennessee Valley Authority, 1933 Civilian Conservation Corps, 1933 Soil Conservation and Domestic Allotment Act, 1933	Wilderness Preservation Act, 1964 Air and Water Quality Acts, 1965	FDR: LBJ: [FY1 Nixon signed more acts than these two National Environmental Policy Act, Created the EPA, Clean Air Act, Marine Mammal Protection Act, Safe Drinking Water Act, Endangered Species Act] Were they more similar or different?
Housing and Urban Development	Rural Electrification Administration, 1935 Home Owners Loan Corporation, 1933 Federal Housing Act, 1934 Federal Housing Administration (created by FHA), 1934 Housing Act of 1937, 1937	Urban Mass Transportation Act, 1964 Omnibus Housing Act, 1964 Housing and Urban Development Act, 1965 Metropolitan Area Redevelopment and Demonstration Cities Acts, 1966	FDR: LBJ: Were they more similar or different?

Unit	8,	Period	8
------	----	--------	---

Area of Reform	FDR's New Deal	LBJ's Great Society	For each reform, explain how FDR & LBJ's beliefs and policies affected American Society, the role of the federal government, or political alignments as well as noting the extent to which they were similar or different.
	Agricultural Adjustment Act, 1933		FDR:
Economic Opportunity; Un- employment	1933 Tennessee Valley Authority, 1933 Civilian Conservation Corps, 1933 Federal Emergency Relief Administration, 1933 Civil Works Administration, 1933 Public Works Administration, 1933 Resettlement Administration, 1935 Works Progress Administration, 1935 National Youth	Economic Opportunity Act, 1964 which created: Office of Economic Opportunity, Head Start, VISTA Tax Reduction Act, 1964 Appalachian Regional and Development Act, 1965	LBJ:
	Administration, 1935 Farm Security Administration, 1937		Were they more similar or different?
	Agricultural Adjustment Act of 1938, 1938		

Comparing and Contrasting The New Deal and the Great Society

<u>Debrief:</u> After analyzing the similarities and differences between Franklin Roosevelt's New Deal and Lyndon B. Johnson's Great Society, what is your general conclusion? Are they more alike or more different? Did you address all three categories (effects of policies) in your analysis? If not, go back and address what is missing.

Thesis: Address the prompt by writing a complete introduction using your formula! This should be several sentences. LC. Although X, Y because ABC. ATFP!

LC= Explain the context of questions by identifying characteristics of the era that relates to the topic of your essay and place it on the timeline relatively or absolutely.

X = more similar or different, your counter-argument explained thoroughly with a piece of specific evidence.

A, B, C = similarities or differences between the two things, broken up into organizational categories... if the prompt provides categories... use them!

Y = your assertion statement... were they more alike or more different (remember to take a stand!)

ATFP = Address The Full Prompt... Make sure you do more than restate the prompt! Make sure you address everything... Make sure you are clear on the skill being tested! Compare and contrast Franklin Roosevelt's New Deal and Lyndon Johnson's Great Society by explaining how their beliefs and policies affected American society, the role of the federal government, and political alignments.

Extension: On a separate sheet of paper, write a full conclusion explaining how your comparison relates to another time period and event. This synthesis should be several sentences!

Historical Analysis Activity written by Rebecca Richardson, Allen High School as, and thesis formula which was adapted from John P. Irish, Carroll High School

using the 2015 Revised College Board Advanced Placement United States history framework, public domain images, and thesis formula which was adapted from John P. Irish, Carroll High School